Edip Yuksel vs. Ali Sina Round 1 Part 1

Edip Yuksel vs. Ali Sina

Round I

> Next

Someone contacted Dr. Edip Yuksel, a prominent member of the submitters and a follower of Dr. Rashid Khalifa to debate with me (Ali Sina). Dr. Yuksel kindly accepted the challenge and here is our discussion.

Dear Edip Yuksel

The invitation must have been sent to you by one of the members of FFI. But I am glad that you agreed to this exchange.

I will start with something that needs clarification and it has to do with your position as a “Quran only” Muslim.

You apparently deny all the Hadiths. Can you please tell us whether you also deny the books of history such as Srat, Tabari and Al Waqidi?

If so on what you base your knowledge of Muhammad as a historic person? How do you know about him, his life, his companions, etc?

Do you perform the rituals of obligatory prayers fasting, hajj etc? If you do how do you know that is the way Muhammad intended. There are no descriptions of these rituals in the Quran. All these details are in the hadith which constitute the bases of the sunna. But you deny the authenticity of the hadith. So where do you get the important information that is missing in the Quran?

Finally, do you recognize the importance of some of the hadiths at least for their historic value?

Dear Ali Sina:

A good question.

Syrat (history of prophet and his companions) were written after hadith and civil war intellectually and emotionally contaminated the so-called Islamic land. Though some are more critical than the other, still they all rely on hadith and hearsay. Besides, they are also not immune from the influence of political and religious powers of their time.

Historically, the Quran is the most authentic book reflecting the events. In fact, the Quran is like a journal of major events with lost chronology. Surely, you will claim that the narrative of the Quran is from the perspective of Muhammad and his interest. I think and hope that we will find a way to come into a reasonable agreement on major historical events.

I do not think that you are relying on every historical report of the syrah books, such as Tabari or Waqidi. I will treat each historical anecdote on ad-hoc basis and evaluate it critically with a healthy dose of suspicion.

I think we both will agree on many issues, as long as we both try our best to be consistent and objective on the purported stories.

Quote:
If so on what you base your knowledge of Muhammad as a historic person? How do you know about him, his life, his companions, etc?

I mostly rely on the narration of the Quran. If the Quran's account contradicts the account of a particular narration I chose the narrative of the Quran since it was written down when events were happening. However, if you chose the narrative of a book written five or ten centuries after the events, I expect you to provide a good reason for that choice.

Quote:
Do you perform the rituals of obligatory prayers fasting, hajj etc? If you do how do you know that is the way Muhammad intended. There are no descriptions of these rituals in the Quran. All these details are in the hadith which constitute the bases of the Sunna. But you deny the authenticity of the hadith. So where do you get the important information that is missing in the Quran?

Interesting. I hear similar questions from Sunnis and Shiites. I do not follow any ritual that is not in the Quran. I argue that all the details of Salaat (contact) prayer, zakat (purification of blessings), hajj (annual conference in Mecca), and fasting in Ramadan are given in the Quran. For instance, if you have time, please find my article "How to Pray According to the Quran" at my website, yuksel.org

Quote:
Finally, do you recognize the importance of some of the hadiths at least for their historic value?

Hadith, like every heresy, legend or story may contain some truth. They at least reflect the spoken language of their time, the culture, general events, mindset, economy, political and social tension among groups and nations.

However, I will not consider Hadith as authority besides the Quran even if I know hundred percent that it was uttered by Muhammad. I dedicate my religion to God alone, and I reject the religion of limited partnership that is based on Allah + Muhammad + Muhammad's companions + early imams + mujtahids + later imams, etc.

Peace,

_
Edip Yuksel
www.yuksel.org
www.19.org